

City of Burlingame

BURLINGAME CITY HALL 501 PRIMROSE ROAD BURLINGAME, CA 94010

Meeting Minutes Planning Commission

Tuesday, November 13, 2018

7:00 PM

Council Chambers

b. 1020 Toyon Drive, zoned R-1 - Application for Design Review for a new two-story single family dwelling and detached garage. (Genesis King Hwa LLC, applicant and property owner; Christian Ruffat, designer) (75 noticed) Staff Contact: Michelle Markiewicz

All Commissioners had visited the project site. There were no ex-parte communications to report.

Community Development Director Gardiner provided an overview of the staff report.

Questions of staff:

> Does this property back up to the SummerHill site? (Gardiner: Yes.)

Chair Gaul opened the public hearing.

Christian Rufatt represented the applicant, with the property owner.

Commission Questions/Comments:

- > What color will the metal roof be? Just include it in the next pass.
- > Would like the sizes of the fascia and trim to be indicated on the plans.
- > What is "TTW"? Will that be wood siding? ("To the weather." It is a stained natural wood siding utilizing T moldings at the corners to minimize any trim work. It will butt into a metal corner channel.)
- > What are the sizes of the columns in the front? (Rufatt: 12 inches. The veneer will make them slightly thicker, to 14-16 inches.)
- > The existing oak tree is proposed to be removed. It looks like it is on the property line. Has that been coordinated with the neighbors? (Owner: Yes, neighbors have seen the plans with the tree shown removed. The property owners had previously applied to have the tree removed, since roots are causing damage to the property. Will also be building a new fence.)(Rufatt: Also, would not have the required width for the driveway, so would have to have a notch.) Should check with Parks Department for the removal.

Public Comments:

Neighbor to the right, 1016 Toyon Drive: Spoke with original owner of 1020 Toyon Drive. The tree is located on the 1020 Toyon property. It was planted 30 years ago, and side of trunk is 9 feet from the corner of the house. The driveway has cracks, and is concerned that the roots will break the foundation. Removal permit was originally denied because the roots have not yet damaged the foundation, but when that happens it will be costly to repair.

Commission Questions/Comments (continued):

- > Is the side door on the garage a glazed door? (Rufatt: Yes.) Should be indicated on the plans.
- > Is the window specified Anderson 400? (Rufatt: Yes.) The commission cannot specify manufacturers, but this is one of the vinyl windows that have been approved in the past, for its look, detailing, etc. Otherwise the commission does not typically approve vinyl windows. (Rufatt: The owners can commit to that window, as they have used it before on other projects.)

- > Will the skylight be flat or domed? (Rufatt: Flat glass.) Should be noted.
- > 10' plate on first floor, 8 1/2' on second. Can it be lower? The porch has spindly columns, tall forehead, makes first floor look really tall. Would help with the proportions if it was lower, such as 9' or 9 1/2'.
- > The fascias are much wider than others in the neighborhood. With the metal roofing, it almost gives it a commercial look.
- > Could the number of materials in the front be simplified? Or bring a board. (Rufatt: There are three materials. Can bring a board.)
- > Rear balcony is fine on this house, with new townhouses being built behind.
- > What is intended for the garage door? (Rufatt: Aluminum frame frosted glass door. Had also considered wood. The ownership would be open to either.) Would prefer wood.

Chair Gaul closed the public hearing.

Commission Discussion:

- > Nice application, other than the plate height on the first floor. Elevations are well organized, roof forms are simple.
- > Sad to see the oak tree go, but it will continue to be a problem.
- > Columns look skinny.
- > Materials seem jumbled. The stone on the columns suggest they would be supporting a big beam, and doesn't understand the stone in the center. There is rough stone, but then smooth stucco. It is trying to be both modern and traditional in its materials, but is not holding together.
- > Bringing the plate height down will help. Forehead looks too high.
- > If the garage door is aluminum frame, would think the windows should also be aluminum-clad. Could be a darker anodized finish. Then the garage and window materials would match, which would help bring it all together.
- > Nice design but does not fit in the neighborhood. Other houses are quaint and small. The neighborhood can support a two-story house, but it's too tall. Given the scale of the surrounding houses, the plate heights should be no higher than 9' and 8'.
- > Architectural style does not fit in with the neighborhood.
- > Porch needs work, feels uninviting. Has an industrial appearance.

Commissioner Kelly made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Sargent, to refer the application to a design review consultant. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Sargent, Kelly, Comaroto, Gaul, and Terrones

Absent: 2 - Loftis, and Tse





City of Burlingame

BURLINGAME CITY HALL 501 PRIMROSE ROAD BURLINGAME, CA 94010

Meeting Minutes Planning Commission

Tuesday, November 13, 2018

7:00 PM

Council Chambers

1020 Toyon Drive, zoned R-1 - Application for Design Review for a new two-story single b. family dwelling and detached garage. (Genesis King Hwa LLC, applicant and property owner; Christian Ruffat, designer) (75 noticed) Staff Contact: Michelle Markiewicz

All Commissioners had visited the project site. There were no ex-parte communications to report.

Community Development Director Gardiner provided an overview of the staff report.

Questions of staff:

Does this property back up to the SummerHill site? (Gardiner: Yes.)

Chair Gaul opened the public hearing.

Christian Rufatt represented the applicant, with the property owner.

Commission Questions/Comments:

COLOR & MATERIALS SAMPLES TO BE

- What color will the metal roof be? Just include it in the next pass. PROVIDE FOR MEETING
- Would like the sizes of the fascia and trim to be indicated on the plans. NOTED ON SHEET A5
- What is "TTW"? Will that be wood siding? ("To the weather." It is a stained natural wood siding utilizing T moldings at the corners to minimize any trim work. It will butt into a metal corner channel.) TO THE WEATHER
- What are the sizes of the columns in the front? (Rufatt: 12 inches. The veneer will make them slightly thicker, to 14-16 inches.) COLUMNS TO BE 14" NOMINAL
- The existing oak tree is proposed to be removed. It looks like it is on the property line. Has that been coordinated with the neighbors? (Owner: Yes, neighbors have seen the plans with the tree shown removed. The property owners had previously applied to have the tree removed, since roots are causing damage to the property. Will also be building a new fence.)(Rufatt: Also, would not have the required width for the driveway, so would have to have a notch.) Should check with Parks Department for the removal. EXISTING TREE TO BE REMOVED

Public Comments:

Neighbor to the right, 1016 Toyon Drive: Spoke with original owner of 1020 Toyon Drive. The tree is located on the 1020 Toyon property. It was planted 30 years ago, and side of trunk is 9 feet from the corner of the house. The driveway has cracks, and is concerned that the roots will break the foundation. Removal permit was originally denied because the roots have not yet damaged the foundation, but when that happens it will be costly to repair.

Commission Questions/Comments (continued):

- Is the side door on the garage a glazed door? (Rufatt: Yes.) Should be indicated on the plans. GLAZED GARAGE DOOR
- Is the window specified Anderson 400? (Rufatt: Yes.) The commission cannot specify manufacturers, but this is one of the vinyl windows that have been approved in the past, for its look, detailing, etc. Otherwise the commission does not typically approve vinyl windows. (Rufatt: The owners can commit to that window, as they have used it before on other projects.) ANDERSON 400 SERIES NOTED ON PLANS

- > Will the skylight be flat or domed? (Rufatt: Flat glass.) Should be noted. FLAT GLASS SKLIGHT NOTED SHT.A5
- > 10' plate on first floor, 8 1/2' on second. Can it be lower? The porch has spindly columns, tall forehead, makes first floor look really tall. Would help with the proportions if it was lower, such as 9' or 9 1/2'. LOWERED FIRST FLOOR PLATE 6". LOWERED LOWER ROOF 12" SEE SHT. A5
- > The fascias are much wider than others in the neighborhood. With the metal roofing, it almost gives it a commercial look. FASCIA TO BE 8" APPROX.
- > Could the number of materials in the front be simplified? Or bring a board. (Rufatt: There are three materials. Can bring a board.) NUMBER OF MATERIALS TO BE 2 ONLY WOOD & STUCCO
- > Rear balcony is fine on this house, with new townhouses being built behind. ADDED WOOD CORBELS AT DECK
- > What is intended for the garage door? (Rufatt: Aluminum frame frosted glass door. Had also considered wood. The ownership would be open to either.) Would prefer wood.

GARAGE DOOR TO BE ALUMINUM WITH GLAZED GLASS

Chair Gaul closed the public hearing.

Commission Discussion:

- > Nice application, other than the plate height on the first floor. Elevations are well organized, roof forms are simple. PLATE HEIGHT AT FIRST FLOOR BROUGHT DOWN TO 9'-6"
- > Sad to see the oak tree go, but it will continue to be a problem.
- > Columns look skinny. COLUMNS TO BE 14" NOMINAL
- > Materials seem jumbled. The stone on the columns suggest they would be supporting a big beam, and doesn't understand the stone in the center. There is rough stone, but then smooth stucco. It is trying to be both modern and traditional in its materials, but is not holding together. REMOVED STONE VENEERS
- > Bringing the plate height down will help. Forehead looks too high. BROUGHT LOWER ROOF DOWN 12"
- > If the garage door is aluminum frame, would think the windows should also be aluminum-clad. Could be a darker anodized finish. Then the garage and window materials would match, which would help bring it all together.

 WINDOWS TO BE ANDERSON 400 SERIES ALUMINUM
- > Nice design but does not fit in the neighborhood. Other houses are quaint and small. The neighborhood can support a two-story house, but it's too tall. Given the scale of the surrounding houses, the plate heights should be no higher than 9' and 8'. LOWER FIRST FLOOR PLATE TO 9'-6"
 OTHER HOUSES ARE 60 YRS OLD OUR HOUSE TO FIT W/NEW
- > Architectural style does not fit in with the neighborhood. PROJECT AT REAR OF LOT NICELY
- > Porch needs work, feels uninviting. Has an industrial appearance. REVISED FRONT PORCH & ENTRY DOOR

Commissioner Kelly made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Sargent, to refer the application to a design review consultant. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Sargent, Kelly, Comaroto, Gaul, and Terrones

Absent: 2 - Loftis, and Tse

Design Review Memo City of Burlingame

Date: December 21, 2018

Planning Commission
City of Burlingame
501 Primrose Road, Burlingame, CA 94010

Re: 1020 Toyon Rd.

Designer: Christian Ruffat (Residential Design Solutions)

Planner: Michelle Markiewicz

I have received and reviewed the original plans submitted to the Planning Commission for 1020 Toyon Rd. I listened to the Planning Commission's comments in the meeting video. I met with the owner, Architect, and Planner at City Hall to discuss the Planning Commission's comments. Per our suggestions, the designer made revisions. Following is a comparison between the original design, and the current plan.

Revisions to original design:

Floor Plans:

- Front porch has been reconfigured to eliminate really shallow section and provide for a front facing door within the porch.
- Second floor has been modified to create an actual offset between bedroom 2 and 3.

Front elevation:

- The stone has been removed
- The porch has been reconfigured and has wood columns
- The first floor plate and building height has been lowered.
- The framing has been altered such that the first floor wall heights reduce an additional foot in addition to the plate reduction.
- A bay window has been added to the living room.
- The upstairs bedroom now includes an actual wall offset rather than just the old gutter line.
- Garage doors have been revised.
- The rake trim has been revised.

Right elevation:

- The first floor plate and building height has been lowered.
- The framing has been altered such that the first floor wall heights reduce an additional foot in addition to the plate reduction.

Rear elevation:

- The first floor plate and building height has been lowered.
- The framing has been altered such that the first floor wall heights reduce an additional foot in addition to the plate reduction.
- The lower door widths have been revised to match the second floor doors.
- The rake trim has been updated.

Left elevation:

- The first floor plate and building height has been lowered.
- The framing has been altered such that the first floor wall heights reduce an additional foot in addition to the plate reduction.
- The stone has been removed.

DESIGN GUIDELINES:

1. Compatibility of the Architectural Style with that of the Existing Neighborhood.

There are a variety of houses on this block. The style of this house is along "Modern Craftsman" lines, and the proposed design should be compatible. The massing has been cleaned up and improved.

2. Respect for Parking and Garage Patterns in the Neighborhood

The proposed detached garage provides for more space between houses, and meets the parking requirements.

3. Architectural Style, Mass & Bulk of the Structure:

The revisions made to the initial proposal have improved the architectural style and massing of the project. The architectural style is more consistent. Proposed changes, such as the refined front porch softens the mass.

4. Interface of the Proposed Structure with the Adjacent Structures to Each Side:

The proposed house will interface reasonably well with its neighbors.

5. Landscaping and its proportion to the Mass and Bulk of Structural Components:

The proposed landscape plan seems reasonable and will be consistent with the neighborhood context.

SUMMARY

The project has been improved since we first saw it. The main concerns were with the plate heights, tallness of the first floor, materials mix, trims, and the porch design. The applicant has redesigned the front porch such that it is larger, more useful, and incorporates a front facing door. The building height has been brought down by lowering the first floor plate height, and also but not over framing the second floor, floor structure, out to the perimeter wall (this drops all lower roofs down by an additional foot). The stone has been removed which simplifies the composition. The fascia boards have an added layer of detail, which brings the scale down to where it wants to be. And an actual offset between the upstairs bedrooms adds authenticity to the front elevation. Perhaps they might want to take a look at making the beam across the front porch out of wood rather than stucco. We did not see a roofing sample, but I would recommend using the shortest seams possible (1" tall due to the hip roof components which will get bulky with taller seams), along with a non-reflective surface. With these changes/clarifications, I am comfortable with this project and would support it.

Sincerely

Randy Grange, AIA LEED AP



COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT • 501 PRIMROSE ROAD • BURLINGAME, CA 94010 p: 650.558.7250 • f: 650.696.3790 • www.burlingame.org

APPLICATION TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION

Type of application: ☐ Design Review ☐ Variance ☐ Parcel #: 02 6240 60 ☐ Conditional Use Permit ☐ Special Permit ☐ Zoning / Other:
PROJECT ADDRESS: 1020 Toyon Doive, Burlingame, CA 940
APPLICANT Name: Genesis Kingthan LC Address: 1400 Fashion Blud Side law Address: 1400 Fashion Island Blud City/State/Zip: San Mates CA, 94404 City/State/Zip: San Mates CA, 94404 Phone: 650 - 618 - 6000 Phone: 650 - 618 - 6000 E-mail: Schang @ Itssenesis us E-mail: Schang @ Its senesis us
ARCHITECT/DESIGNER
Name: Christian Ruffat
Address: 406 La Julia Ave RECEIVED
City/State/Zip: Son Mates CA 98403 AUG 24 2013
Phone: 650-718-816 CITY OF BURLINGAME CDD-PLANNING DIV.
Burlingame Business License #:
Authorization to Reproduce Project Plans: I hereby grant the City of Burlingame the authority to reproduce upon request and/or post plans submitted with this application on the City's website as part of the Planning approval process and waive any claims against the City arising out of or related to such action. PROJECT DESCRIPTION: New 2 5000 Formula Community
AFFIDAVIT/SIGNATURE: I hereby certify under penalty of perjury that the information given herein is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. Applicant's signature: Date: 8 12 4 12018 I am aware of the proposed application and hereby authorize the above applicant to submit this application to the Planning Commission. Property owner's signature: Date: 9 129 12019 Date: 9 129 12019
Date submitted:

RESOLUTION APPROVING CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION AND DESIGN REVIEW

RESOLVED, by the Planning Commission of the City of Burlingame that:

WHEREAS, a Categorical Exemption has been prepared and application has been made for <u>Design Review</u> for <u>a new, two-story single family dwelling with a detached garage</u> at <u>1020 Toyon Drive, Zoned R-1, Genesis King Hwa LLC, property owner, APN: 026-240-160;</u>

WHEREAS, said matters were heard by the Planning Commission of the City of Burlingame on <u>January 14, 2019</u>, at which time it reviewed and considered the staff report and all other written materials and testimony presented at said hearing;

NOW, THEREFORE, it is RESOLVED and DETERMINED by this Planning Commission that:

- 1. On the basis of the Initial Study and the documents submitted and reviewed, and comments received and addressed by this Commission, it is hereby found that there is no substantial evidence that the project set forth above will have a significant effect on the environment, and categorical exemption, per CEQA Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines, which states that construction of a limited number of new, small facilities or structures, including one single-family residence, or a second dwelling unit in a residential zone is exempt from environmental review, is hereby approved.
- 2. Said Design Review is approved subject to the conditions set forth in Exhibit "A" attached hereto. Findings for such Design Review are set forth in the staff report, minutes, and recording of said meeting.

	ther directed that a certified copy of unty of San Mateo.	r this resolution be recorded in the official records o
		Chairman
I,	, Secretary of the P	Planning Commission of the City of Burlingame, do
hereby certify	that the foregoing resolution was i	ntroduced and adopted at a regular meeting of the
Planning Comr	mission held on the 14 th day of Janua	ary, 2019, by the following vote:

Secretary

EXHIBIT "A"

Conditions of Approval for Categorical Exemption and Design Review 1020 Toyon Drive Effective January 24, 2019 Page 1

- 1. that the project shall be built as shown on the plans submitted to the Planning Division date stamped December 21, 2018, sheets A1 through A8, SU-1, and L-1 through L-6;
- 2. that prior to issuance of a building permit, a Tree Removal Permit and arborist report shall be submitted to the City Arborist for removal of the existing 32-inch diameter oak tree along the right side property line. If a Tree Removal Permit is not approved and the City Arborist determines that the design is to accommodate the existing oak tree, the revised project will be subject to review by the Planning Commission (FYI or amendment to be determined by Planning staff);
- 3. that any changes to building materials, exterior finishes, windows, architectural features, roof height or pitch, and amount or type of hardscape materials shall be subject to Planning Division or Planning Commission review (FYI or amendment to be determined by Planning staff);
- 4. that any changes to the size or envelope of the first or second floors, or garage which would include adding or enlarging a dormer (s), shall require an amendment to this permit;
- 5. that any recycling containers, debris boxes or dumpsters for the construction project shall be placed upon the private property, if feasible, as determined by the Community Development Director; that demolition or removal of the existing structures and any grading or earth moving on the site shall not occur until a building permit has been issued and such site work shall be required to comply with all the regulations of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District;
- 6. that prior to issuance of a building permit for construction of the project, the project construction plans shall be modified to include a cover sheet listing all conditions of approval adopted by the Planning Commission, or City Council on appeal; which shall remain a part of all sets of approved plans throughout the construction process. Compliance with all conditions of approval is required; the conditions of approval shall not be modified or changed without the approval of the Planning Commission, or City Council on appeal;
- 7. that all air ducts, plumbing vents, and flies shall be combined, where possible, to a single termination and installed on the portions of the roof not visible from the street; and that these venting details shall be included and approved in the construction plans before a Building permit is issued;
- 8. that the project shall comply with the Construction and Demolition Debris Recycling Ordinance which requires affected demolition, new construction and alteration projects to submit a Waste Reduction plan and meet recycling requirements; any partial or full demolition of a structure, interior or exterior, shall require a demolition permit;
- 9. that the project shall meet all the requirements of the California Building and Uniform Fire Codes, 2016 Edition, as amended by the City of Burlingame;

EXHIBIT "A"

Conditions of Approval for Categorical Exemption and Design Review 1020 Toyon Drive Effective January 24, 2019

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS SHALL BE MET DURING THE BUILDING INSPECTION PROCESS PRIOR TO THE INSPECTIONS NOTED IN EACH CONDITION:

- 10. that prior to scheduling the framing inspection the applicant shall provide a certification by the project architect or residential designer, or another architect or residential design professional, that demonstrates that the project falls at or below the maximum approved floor area ratio for the property;
- 11. that prior to scheduling the foundation inspection, a licensed surveyor shall locate the property corners, set the building footprint and certify the first floor elevation of the new structure(s) based on the elevation at the top of the form boards per the approved plans; this survey shall be accepted by the City Engineer;
- 12. prior to scheduling the framing inspection the project architect or residential designer, or another architect or residential design professional, shall provide an architectural certification that the architectural certification that the architectural details shown in the approved design which should be evident at framing, such as window locations and bays, are built as shown on the approved plans; architectural certification documenting framing compliance with approved design shall be submitted to the Building Division before the final framing inspection shall be scheduled;
- 13. that prior to scheduling the roof deck inspection, a licensed surveyor shall shoot the height of the roof ridge and provide certification of that height to the Building Division; and
- 14. that prior to final inspection, Planning Division staff will inspect and note compliance of the architectural details (trim materials, window type, etc.) to verify that the project has been build according to the approved Planning and Building plans.



CITY OF BURLINGAME
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
501 PRIMROSE ROAD
BURLINGAME, CA 94010
PH: (650) 558-7250 @ FAX: (650) 696-3790

PH: (650) 558-7250 • FAX: (650) 696-3790 www.burlingame.org

Site: 1020 TOYON DRIVE

The City of Burlingame Planning Commission announces the following public hearing on MONDAY, JANUARY 14, 2019 at 7:00 P.M. in the City Hall Council Chambers, 501 Primrose Road, Burlingame, CA:

Application for Design Review for a new two-story single-family dwelling and detached garage at 1020 TOYON DRIVE zoned R-1. APN 026-240-160

Mailed: January 4, 2019

(Please refer to other side)

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

City of Burlingame

A copy of the application and plans for this project may be reviewed prior to the meeting at the Community Development Department at 501 Primrose Road, Burlingame, California.

If you challenge the subject application(s) in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues you or someone else raised at the public hearing, described in the notice or in written correspondence delivered to the city at or prior to the public hearing.

Property owners who receive this notice are responsible for informing their tenants about this notice.

For additional information, please call (650) 558-7250. Thank you.

Kevin Gardiner, AICP Community Development Director

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

(Please refer to other side)

9029 90gg <u>O</u> *©*@ er. 6 a_s 0₉₀ 800

1020 Toyon Drive 300' Radius APN # 026.240.140