



PROJECT LOCATION
1453 Bernal Avenue

City of Burlingame

Design Review

Item No. 8a
Regular Action Item

Address: 1453 Bernal Avenue

Meeting Date: September 9, 2019

Request: Application for Design Review for a new, two-story single family dwelling and detached garage.

Applicant and Designer: Tim Raduenz, Form + One Design

APN: 026-044-070

Property Owners: Josh and Lisa Friedman

Zoning: R-1

General Plan: Low Density Residential

Lot Area: 5,997 SF

Environmental Review Status: The project is Categorically Exempt from review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), per Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines, which states that construction of a limited number of new, small facilities or structures, including one single-family residence, or a second dwelling unit in a residential zone, is exempt from environmental review. In urbanized areas, this exemption may be applied to the construction or conversion of up to three (3) single-family residences as part of a project.

Background: The subject property is not located within the Burlingame Park No. 2, Burlingame Park No. 3, Burlingame Heights, and Glenwood Park subdivisions, which would require that a Historic Resource Evaluation be prepared prior to any significant development project being proposed to assess whether the existing structure(s) could be potentially eligible for listing on the National or California Register of Historical Places.

During the processing of the current Design Review application for the proposed site, a letter was submitted to the City of Burlingame Planning Division, date stamped May 14, 2019, which indicated that this property located in the Easton Addition may have characteristics that could qualify it as potentially eligible for listing on the National or California Register of Historical Places. Therefore, a Historic Resource Evaluation was required to be prepared for this property.

The Historic Resource Evaluation was prepared by Page & Turnbull, Inc. and is dated July 12, 2019 (attached). The results of the evaluation concluded that 1453 Bernal Avenue does not appear to be individually eligible for listing in the National or California Registers under any criteria.

A Design Review application was submitted for the adjacent lot at 1457 Bernal Avenue at the same time as the application for the subject site. The Historic Resource Evaluation for 1457 Bernal Avenue found that this existing property is potentially eligible for listing in the National or California Registers. Currently, the adjacent lot at 1457 Bernal Avenue is proposed to be developed and the project is on the Design Review Study portion of the Planning Commission agenda for this meeting.

Site Description: There are two existing interior and adjacent lots that each have their own address and Assessor's Parcel Number (APN). Lot 7 is on the left and has the address of 1453 Bernal Avenue; Lot 6 is on the right and has the address of 1457 Bernal Avenue.

San Mateo County Assessor's Appraisal reports dated 1948 state that the house on 1457 Bernal Avenue was built in 1908, and that originally there was a four-car garage at 1453 Bernal Avenue to service the main dwelling at 1457 Bernal Avenue. A portion of the four-car garage on 1453 Bernal Avenue was converted to a two-story house in approximately 1948.

Both lots are accessed from a single existing curb cut in front of 1453 Bernal Avenue, which leads to the parking garage attached to the single family dwelling on that lot. There is no covered parking on site at 1457 Bernal Avenue and therefore is considered to be existing nonconforming.

For the purpose of development, these qualify as two independent and existing R-1 zoned lots. There are no existing structures that straddle the common property line and that are proposed to be demolished, which would require a Conditional Use Permit to be developed independently as re-emerging lots.

Project Summary: For the subject property at 1453 Bernal Avenue, the applicant is proposing to demolish the existing single family dwelling and attached garage and to build a new, two-story single family dwelling with a detached garage. The proposed house will total 3,413 SF (0.57 FAR) where 3,415 SF (0.57 FAR) is the maximum allowed.

There will be a total of four bedrooms in the proposed main dwelling (office does not qualify as a bedroom since it is open to the hallway). A total of two on-site parking spaces are required, one of which must be covered. The detached garage provides one covered parking spaces (10' x 20') and an uncovered parking space (9' x 20') is provided in the driveway leading to the garage. To access the proposed detached garage, the applicant is proposing to remove the existing curb cut at 1453 Bernal Avenue and to replace it with a curb cut that is on the far left side of the property.

The applicant submitted an arborist report, which was prepared by Kielty Arborist Services, dated May 22, 2019 (attached). The arborist report includes an evaluation of the trees on both 1453 and 1457 Bernal Avenue, as well as the street trees in front of these properties. The existing street trees will remain. The arborist report notes that the existing trees on the private properties are in fair to good condition.

With regards to the proposed project site at 1453 Bernal Avenue, there is one protected-size tree, a 28.7-inch diameter Magnolia tree, located towards the front of the site. A Protected Tree Removal Permit was tentatively approved on August 5, 2019, with the condition that the Magnolia tree can be removed only if the Planning Commission agrees that the project cannot be altered to save the tree. The City Arborist notes that the tree is in good health and is not located in the footprint of the proposed project. The Landscape Plan shows that with the removal of the protected-size Magnolia tree, there are proposed to be three, 24-inch box landscape trees planted throughout the site, where a total of three trees are required.

All other Zoning Code requirements have been met. The applicant is requesting the following application:

- Design Review for one new, two-story single family dwelling and detached garage (CS 25.57.010);

1453 Bernal Avenue (Lot 7)

Lot Area: 5,997 SF

Plans date stamped: August 28, 2019

| | PROPOSED | ALLOWED/ REQUIRED |
|------------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| SETBACKS | | |
| Front (1st flr): | 23'-11" | 21'-9" is the block average |
| (2nd flr): | 29'-5" | 21'-9" |
| Side (left): | 10'-0" | 4'-0" |
| (right): | 4'-0" | 4'-0" |
| Rear (1st flr): | 42'-0" | 15'-0" |
| (2nd flr): | 42'-8" | 20'-0" |
| Lot Coverage: | 2,163 SF 36% | 2,399 SF 40% |
| FAR: | 3,413 SF 0.57 FAR | 3,415 SF ¹ 0.57 FAR |
| # of bedrooms: | 4 | --- |

¹ (0.32 x 5,997 SF) + 1,100+ 400 SF = 3,415 SF (0.57 FAR)

1453 Bernal Avenue (Lot 7)

Lot Area: 5,997 SF

Plans date stamped: August 28, 2019

| | PROPOSED | ALLOWED/ REQUIRED |
|-----------------------------------|---|---|
| Off-Street Parking: | 1 covered (10' x 20') 1 uncovered (9' x 20') | 1 covered (10' x 20') 1 uncovered (9' x 20') |
| Building Height: | 29'-0" | 30'-0" |
| Declining Height Envelope: | complies | CS 25.26.075 |

Summary of Proposed Exterior Materials:

- **Windows:** windows will be aluminum clad wood with simulated true divided lites; wood trim.
- **Doors:** wood doors; wood garage door.
- **Siding:** horizontal wood siding with mitered corners on the first floor and board and batten wood siding on the second floor.
- **Roof:** diamond shaped asphalt shingles.
- **Other:** squared wood porch columns and 6 x 6 wood brackets.

Staff Comments: See the Parks Division comments, dated July 17, 2019, that state the Protected Tree Removal Permit will only be approved if the Planning Commission determines that it cannot be retained.

Design Review Study Meeting: At the Planning Commission design review study meeting on August 26, 2019, the Commission had several comments regarding this project and voted to place this item on the regular action calendar when all information has been submitted and reviewed by the Planning Division (see attached August 26, 2019 Planning Commission Minutes).

The applicant submitted a response letter and revised plans date stamped August 28, 2019, and Certified Arborists' emails date stamped August 28 and August 30, 2019, to address the Planning Commission's questions and comments. Listed below are the Commission's comments and responses by the applicant.

1. A square porch column would be more in-keeping with the proposed design than the ionic columns shown.

- The applicant has revised the plans to show square columns.

2. For better symmetry, the front door should be wider or have two sidelites with muntin pattern to match windows.

- Front door width has been revised to 42 inches, is centered between the porch columns, and has no sidelites.

3. Specify dimensions for the horizontal and board and batten siding.

- Elevations show a 1' x 8' horizontal siding; Sheet A5.0 shows the board and batten detail with the battens placed 16 inches on center.

4. Balcony is missing from the left elevation.

- Revised on the plans.

4. A rendering would be helpful to bring this design alive and to clarify the proposed siding.

- Rendering has been submitted and will be included in the presentation slides.

5. The existing protected size Magnolia in the front yard is a special feature. Can it be moved elsewhere on the property?

- The applicant inquired about the cost and likelihood of survival for moving the protected-size Magnolia tree. It was not possible to obtain a detailed quote prior to the deadline for the next Planning Commission hearing, but the applicant has provided an email from Kielty Arborist Services, date stamped August 28, 2019 and an email from Treemovers, Inc., date stamped August 30, 2019, which note that the tree would be difficult to move, has a predicted 50% survival rate if moved, and the approximate cost of the tree relocation is \$75,000 (attached).

Design Review Criteria: The criteria for design review as established in Ordinance No. 1591 adopted by the Council on April 20, 1998 are outlined as follows:

1. Compatibility of the architectural style with that of the existing character of the neighborhood;
2. Respect for the parking and garage patterns in the neighborhood;
3. Architectural style and mass and bulk of structure;
4. Interface of the proposed structure with the structures on adjacent properties; and
5. Landscaping and its proportion to mass and bulk of structural components.

Suggested Findings for Design Review: At the August 26, 2019 design review study meeting the Planning Commission noted that the massing of the proposed house, as well as the larger front setback, help the house to blend with the fabric of the neighborhood. The mix of horizontal and board and batten sidings gives the house a less vertical presence, even though it is two stories. Architectural details such as the aluminum clad wood windows with simulated true divided lites, wood brackets, and wood gable vents are consistent with the traditional style of the existing houses in the neighborhood. The detached garage is consistent with the block pattern and will allow a greater setback for the neighbor on the left that has an existing, non-conforming side setback. For these reasons the project may be found to be compatible with the requirements of the City's five design review criteria.

Planning Commission Action:

The Planning Commission should conduct a public hearing on the application, and consider public testimony and the analysis contained within the staff report. Action should include specific findings supporting the Planning Commission's decision, and should be affirmed by resolution of the Planning Commission. The reasons for any action should be stated clearly for the record. At the public hearing the following conditions should be considered:

1. that the project shall be built as shown on the plans submitted to the Planning Division date stamped August 28, 2019, sheets T1.0 through A9.0, and L 1.0;
2. that any changes to building materials, exterior finishes, windows, architectural features, roof height or pitch, and amount or type of hardscape materials shall be subject to Planning Division or Planning Commission review (FYI or amendment to be determined by Planning staff);

3. that any changes to the size or envelope of the basement, first or second floors, or garage, which would include adding or enlarging a dormer(s), shall require an amendment to this permit;
4. that prior to removal of the protected-size Magnolia tree on site, the applicant shall receive approval for a Protected Size Tree Removal Permit from the Parks Division;
5. that any recycling containers, debris boxes or dumpsters for the construction project shall be placed upon the private property, if feasible, as determined by the Community Development Director;
6. that demolition for removal of the existing structures and any grading or earth moving on the site shall not occur until a building permit has been issued and such site work shall be required to comply with all the regulations of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District;
7. that prior to issuance of a building permit for construction of the project, the project construction plans shall be modified to include a cover sheet listing all conditions of approval adopted by the Planning Commission, or City Council on appeal; which shall remain a part of all sets of approved plans throughout the construction process. Compliance with all conditions of approval is required; the conditions of approval shall not be modified or changed without the approval of the Planning Commission, or City Council on appeal;
8. that all air ducts, plumbing vents, and flues shall be combined, where possible, to a single termination and installed on the portions of the roof not visible from the street; and that these venting details shall be included and approved in the construction plans before a Building permit is issued;
9. that the project shall comply with the Construction and Demolition Debris Recycling Ordinance which requires affected demolition, new construction and alteration projects to submit a Waste Reduction plan and meet recycling requirements; any partial or full demolition of a structure, interior or exterior, shall require a demolition permit;
10. that the project shall meet all the requirements of the California Building and Uniform Fire Codes, in effect at time of building permit submittal, as amended by the City of Burlingame;

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS SHALL BE MET DURING THE BUILDING INSPECTION PROCESS PRIOR TO THE INSPECTIONS NOTED IN EACH CONDITION:

11. that prior to scheduling the framing inspection the applicant shall provide a certification by the project architect or residential designer, or another architect or residential design professional, that demonstrates that the project falls at or below the maximum approved floor area ratio for the property;
12. that prior to scheduling the foundation inspection, a licensed surveyor shall locate the property corners, set the building footprint and certify the first floor elevation of the new structure(s) based on the elevation at the top of the form boards per the approved plans; this survey shall be accepted by the City Engineer;
13. that prior to scheduling the framing inspection the project architect or residential designer, or another architect or residential design professional, shall provide an architectural certification that the architectural details shown in the approved design which should be evident at framing, such as window locations and bays, are built as shown on the approved plans; architectural certification documenting framing compliance with approved design shall be submitted to the Building Division before the final framing inspection shall be scheduled;
14. that prior to scheduling the roof deck inspection, a licensed surveyor shall shoot the height of the roof

ridge and provide certification of that height to the Building Division; and

15. that prior to final inspection, Planning Division staff will inspect and note compliance of the architectural details (trim materials, window type, etc.) to verify that the project has been built according to the approved Planning and Building plans.

Erika Lewit
Senior Planner

Attachments:

August 26, 2019 Planning Commission Minutes
Applicant's Response to Commission's comments, dated stamped August 28, 2019
Email submitted by Kielty Arborist Services, date stamped August 28, 2019
Email submitted by Treemovers Inc., date stamped August 30, 2019
Application to the Planning Commission
Certified Arborist Report, prepared by Kielty Arborist Services, dated May 22, 2019
Protected Tree Removal Permit Application, dated August 5, 2019
Parks Division Comments, dated July 17, 2019
Letter from a neighbor to review history of the property, date stamped May 14, 2019
Emails and letters from neighbors, date stamped August 17, 19, 20, 21, 22 and August 26, 2019
Planning Commission Resolution (Proposed)
Notice of Public Hearing – Mailed August 30, 2019
Area Map

Separate Attachments:

Historical Resource Evaluation conducted by Page & Turnbull, Inc., dated July 12, 2019